What does it take to sustain effective practices in schools?

Kent McIntosh
University of Oregon

Thanks and Acknowledgments

- Traditional owners and Elders
- AASE Conference Organising Committee
- Co-authors
- Participants in sustainability research

Handouts:
http://www.pbis.org

Goals for this Session

1. Describe the factors related to promoting sustainability of PBIS in schools
2. Share results of a few research studies
3. Provide strategies for sustaining effective practices...as soon as tomorrow

Handouts:
http://www.pbis.org

Do you have a deep understanding of the principles of sustainability?

- Common perception that sustainability is a ethereal, theoretical concept (Vaughn et al., 2000)
- We all have experiences with it
- The same principles of individual behaviour still apply to systems...
Definition

- Sustainability
  - Durable implementation of a practice at a level of fidelity that continues to produce valued outcomes (McIntosh et al., 2009)

What is…

**fidelity of implementation?**

- The extent to which the critical features of PBIS are implemented as intended

**Why assess it?**

- Helps us improve outcomes for students
- Helps team target next steps and areas for improvement

Survey of 2,000 Educators

- 100% of districts reporting using PBIS
- 57% of teachers using PBIS practices frequently or very frequently
- 93% of districts implementing an SEL curriculum
- 25% of teachers using an SEL curriculum in their classes
Sustainability

Durable implementation of a practice at a level of fidelity that continues to produce valued outcomes (McIntosh et al., 2009)

What are… valued outcomes?

That’s up to you!
In keeping with the new state initiative, this fall we will be implementing an exciting new district initiative of SNI in place of LYI. All PD days previously scheduled for LYI will be rescheduled as staff development for SNI. The $500 for release time and materials for LYI will be discontinued and provided instead for SNI. By the way, you will need to create local SNI teams that meet weekly. The former members of your LYI team would be perfect for this new team. Your new SNI binders will be coming next week. Have a great year!!!
PBIS in the real world...

Four Principles for Sustaining Schoolwide Systems

- Promote **PRIORITY**
- Ensure **EFFECTIVENESS**
- Increase **EFFICIENCY**
- Use data for **CONTINUOUS REGENERATION**

What is **PRIORITY**?

- Importance in comparison to other practices
- Incorporation into core system components
- Connection to other initiatives

Promoting **PRIORITY**

- Maximize visibility
  - Present data to people with resources
  - Describe effects of abandoning support for the practice
- Get into written policy
- Braid project with other initiatives
  - Show how practice can lead to outcomes of new initiatives
Restorative Practices
Social & Emotional Learning
Anti-Bullying Initiatives
Academic Achievement
Family Engagement
Trauma Informed Care
Reducing Racial Inequities

Let's take an example…

ACEs are ADVERSE CHILDHOOD EXPERIENCES

The three types of ACEs include:

- **Abuse**
  - Physical
  - Emotional
  - Sexual

- **Neglect**
  - Physical
  - Emotional

- **Household Dysfunction**
  - Mental Illness
  - Incarcerated Relative
  - Mother treated violently
  - Substance Abuse
  - Divorce

Of 17,000 ACE study participants:

- 26% have experienced 1 ACE
- 19% have experienced 2 ACEs
- 9.5% have experienced 3 ACEs
- 12.4% have experienced 4+ ACEs
- 64% have experienced at least 1 ACE
Integrating initiatives example: Trauma-informed Care

- A possible solution:
  - Create a stand-alone program that requires extensive mental health training and becomes one more thing teachers are asked to do.

- A better solution:
  - Create safe, predictable, and positive learning environments for all students, regardless of need.
  - Give students skills to identify and self-regulate their emotions.
  - Provide more support to students who need more.

https://www.pbis.org/resource/integrating-a-trauma-informed-approach-within-a-pbis-framework
Disproportionality in School Discipline

Out of School Suspension Risk Index
2017-18 US Schools (n = 97,632)

How well are we serving all students?

PBIS Cultural Responsiveness Field Guide
(Leverson et al., 2021)

- Three sections:
  1. Identity awareness
  2. TFI Cultural Responsiveness Companion
  3. Appendices

https://www.pbis.org/topics/equity

“If you ran a hospital, but you were only known for serving people who are healthy, well, then you wouldn’t be a very good hospital.”

- Pedro Noguera
## Teaching Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Matrix</th>
<th>All Settings</th>
<th>Halls</th>
<th>Playgrounds</th>
<th>Cafeteria/Library/Computer</th>
<th>Assembly</th>
<th>Bus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expectations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect Ourselves</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect Others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect the Environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1. Expectations

#### 2. Natural Context (Locations)

#### 3. Specific Examples

## INCORPORATE Coping Strategies for Managing Stress

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Matrix</th>
<th>All Settings</th>
<th>Halls</th>
<th>Playgrounds</th>
<th>Lunch</th>
<th>Library/Assembly</th>
<th>Bus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expectations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achieving &amp; Organized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1. Expectations

#### 2. Natural Context (Locations)

#### 3. Specific Examples

## INCORPORATE Bullying Prevention / Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Matrix</th>
<th>All Settings</th>
<th>Halls</th>
<th>Playgrounds</th>
<th>Library/Computer</th>
<th>Assembly</th>
<th>Bus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expectations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achieving &amp; Organized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1. Expectations

#### 2. Natural Context (Locations)

#### 3. Specific Examples

## Class Routines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Exp.</th>
<th>Transition</th>
<th>Indep. Seat Work</th>
<th>Small Group Activities</th>
<th>Teacher-led Instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We are Respectful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Use whisper voice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Keep 6 inches between</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>you and others in line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Raise hand before</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>talking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Turn in work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• You are proud of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Accept each other’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>answers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Eyes on speaker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Listen to each other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Do your part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Use time wisely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Listen to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>teacher instructions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Answer on cue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Take 2-column notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We are Responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Start right on signal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Put materials away</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Read and follow the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>directions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Complete your own work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Do your part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Use time wisely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Listen to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>teacher instructions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Answer on cue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Take 2-column notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We are Safe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Move quickly but safely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Look out for others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sit with 6 feet on the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>floor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Keep objects out of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sit with 6 feet on the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>floor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Keep objects out of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>hands</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Make PBIS Efforts Public!

- Newsletters
  - To parents
- Monthly/quarterly reports
  - To school staff
- Formal presentations
  - To school board
  - To district administrators
  - To PTA
  - To community agencies and businesses
- Local news

Newsletters

Respectful, Responsible, Ready to Learn

School Expectations (Parent Pick-Up)

- Label feeling
  - Use deep breathing
- Use calm words with peers
- Let teacher know feeling yellow or red zone

Total Points

Teacher Initials

Perryville Elementary Parent Newsletter February 2011

Non-example of Family Communication

Make PBIS Efforts Public!

- Newsletters
  - To parents
- Monthly/quarterly reports
  - To school staff
- Formal presentations
  - To school board
  - To district administrators
  - To PTA
  - To community agencies and businesses
- Local news

Newsletters

Respectful, Responsible, Ready to Learn

School Expectations (Parent Pick-Up)

- Label feeling
  - Use deep breathing
- Use calm words with peers
- Let teacher know feeling yellow or red zone

Total Points

Teacher Initials

Perryville Elementary Parent Newsletter February 2011

Non-example of Family Communication
What is **EFFECTIVENESS**?

- Extent to which the practice results in desired outcomes
- Effects must be attributed to the practice

How is my driving?

What is... **fidelity of implementation**?
Ensuring **EFFECTIVENESS**

- Focus on **FIDELITY OF IMPLEMENTATION**
- Assess it regularly
- Use it to enhance what you already do
- Share data showing how fidelity is related to effects

School-wide Information System ([www.swis.org](http://www.swis.org))

**Positive Referrals vs. ODRs:**
FG Leary Fine Arts School, Chilliwack, BC, Canada
Get Positive!

Android:

iOS:

What is **EFFICIENCY**?

- Relationship between continued effort and continued effectiveness
- Weighed against other potential practices

**Get it down on paper**
- Lesson plans
- Schedules
- Agendas

**Focus on efficient team meetings**

*Figure 1. Birth and Death Cycles of Educational Innovations*

(Latham, 1988)

**Increasing EFFICIENCY**

- Get it down on paper
  - Lesson plans
  - Schedules
  - Agendas
- Focus on efficient team meetings
What is **CONTINUOUS REGENERATION**?

- Collection of data to monitor **fidelity**, **outcomes** and **context**
- Adaptation over time while keeping critical features intact
- Ongoing investment in building local capacity

**Using data for CONTINUOUS REGENERATION**

- Adjust practices for a changing environment
  - Priority
  - Effectiveness
  - Efficiency
- Connect with a community of practice

Create **Communities of Practice**

- Share fairs, networking sessions, district mini-conferences, web-based sharing
- Opportunities for school teams
  - Celebrate successes
  - Learn from peers
  - Steal ideas
  - Continue momentum
  - Invite important stakeholders

Websites to Steal Stuff From

- [www.pbis.org](http://www.pbis.org)
- [www.pbisapps.org](http://www.pbisapps.org)
- [www.pbisvideos.com](http://www.pbisvideos.com)
- [www.pbismissouri.org](http://www.pbismissouri.org)
- [www.pbismaryland.org](http://www.pbismaryland.org)
- [www.swis.org](http://www.swis.org)
- [www.pbisnj.org](http://www.pbisnj.org)
Using Data for Decision Making
Sifton Elementary, Vancouver, WA

Cautions for Continuous Regeneration

- When you keep it fresh…
- Consider the critical features of what makes PBIS effective
  - Reward systems – recognition of their success
    - Not a scrap of paper without recognition
    - Not insincere praise
    - Not the same for everyone!
Another **LETHAL MUTATION**

- Praise can be public... corrections should be private

A thought experiment...

- **Ask...**

  "Who are the students who are always on red?"

"Point Positive"

Ways to #DitchtheClip

- "Praise around"
- Nonverbal signal + time delay
- Interdependent group reward systems
- Be+ app
Consider Interdependent Group Acknowledgement Systems

Intermediate Acknowledgment System

Research on PBIS Sustainability
What is the strongest predictor of PBIS sustainability?


- Having a supportive administrator?
- Having a strong PBIS team?

Results: Predictive Model

- Model fit indices acceptable (except $\chi^2$)
  - $\chi^2$ (731) = 881.55, $p < .001$, CFI = .96, TLI = .96, RMSEA = .03
- $R^2 = .45$
- Factors
  - Priority ($B = .14$, $SE = .39$, $p > .05$)
  - Team Use of Data ($B = .61$, $SE = .24$, $p < .05$)
  - District Priority ($B = -1.14$, $SE = .66$, $p > .05$)
  - Capacity Building ($B = .98$, $SE = .43$, $p < .05$)
Takeaways

- PBIS is most sustainable with a supportive administrator and a strong team
- If administrators take too much of a lead, sustainability can suffer
- School teams can benefit from training in running meetings and using data
- District systems (coaching, training, CoPs) enable both admins and teams

District and state systems are the keel in the school’s boat
(McIntosh & Goodman, 2016)

Research Questions

1. To what extent do school personnel ratings of implementation of PBIS systems significantly predict sustained implementation and levels of problem behaviour?
2. Within any statistically significantly predictive PBIS systems, which critical features of these systems significantly predict sustained implementation?

What critical features predict sustained PBIS implementation?
PBIS Self-Assessment Survey (Sugai, Horner, & Todd, 2000)

- Four Systems
  - School-wide
  - Non-classroom
  - Classroom
  - Individual

Which system best predicts sustained implementation (BoQ) 3 years later?

- School-wide
- Non-classroom
- Classroom
- Individual

Which features best predict sustained implementation?

- Expected behaviours defined clearly
- Problem behaviours defined clearly
- Expected behaviours taught
- Expected behaviours acknowledged regularly
- Consistent consequences
- CW procedures consistent with SW systems
- Options exist for instruction
- Instruction/materials match student ability
- High rates of academic success
- Access to assistance and coaching
- Transitions are efficient

Year: 1 2 3
Lessons learned for sustaining schoolwide PBIS

- Focus on bringing PBIS into the classroom
  - Consistency with schoolwide systems
  - High rates of acknowledgment for prosocial behaviour
- Focus on quality differentiated instruction across academic domains
  - Student instruction at their level

Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>All Settings</th>
<th>Hallways</th>
<th>Playground</th>
<th>Cafeteria</th>
<th>Library/Computer Lab</th>
<th>Assembly</th>
<th>Classroom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Class Rules

1. Be: Respect
2. Be: Responsible
3. Be: Safe

Matrix of Classroom Routines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL VALUES</th>
<th>Class-wide</th>
<th>Arrival</th>
<th>Group Work</th>
<th>Independent Work</th>
<th>Whole Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respect</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Best</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**SCHOOL VALUES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classroom Routines</th>
<th>Class-wide</th>
<th>Arrival</th>
<th>Group Work</th>
<th>Independent Work</th>
<th>Whole Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When it gets hard, we TRY our best</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Respect**
- Listen to others
- Use inside voice
- Use kind words
- Ask permission
- Enter/exit classroom prepared
- Use inside voice
- Listen to others
- Accept differences
- Use kind words
- Encourage others
- Use quiet voice
- Follow directions
- Eyes/ears on speaker
- Raise hand to speak
- Contribute to learning
- Be prepared
- Follow directions
- Be a problem solver
- Make choices that support your goals
- Place materials in correct area
- Begin warm-up promptly
- Use time wisely
- Contribute
- Complete your part
- Be a task master
- Use your neighbor
- Follow directions
- Take notes
- Participate when asked

**Personal Best**
- Keep hands, feet, and objects to self
- Organise yourself
- Walk
- Use materials carefully
- Keep hands, feet, and objects to self
- Stay at seat
- Keep hands, feet, and objects to self

**Safety**
- Walk
- Use materials carefully
- Keep hands, feet, and objects to self

---

**Something for Tomorrow**

**“Positive Family Postcards”**

- Give teachers a stamped, pre-addressed postcard for each student in their classrooms at the start of the year
- GOAL: send a quick, positive note home for each student in the school

**Basic Steps:**
1. Purchase or print one postcard for each student in the school
2. Add stamps and address labels for each student’s home address
3. Provide the postcards to classroom teachers
4. Ask teachers to send home a positive note about the student’s behaviour to each family by the end of the year (or term)
Create a Plan to Sustain from the Start

- "Train and Hope"
  - Not an effective approach to implement a practice
- "Implement and Hope"
  - Not an effective way to sustain a practice

3 big ideas to plan for sustainability...

1. Start with the Ending
- Let the outcomes drive the selection of practices
- Identify the valued outcomes for everyone
  - No one has ever been bullied or nagged into long-term sustainability
- Measure and use data in decision making

2. Death, Taxes, and…
   …Attrition
- If the fidelity drops, the effects stop
- Plan for your champions to move on/up
  - Who is the most essential person right now?
- Focus on POSITIONS, not PERSONS
  - Create positions tied to the practice
    - Titles
    - Job Descriptions
    - FTE

3. If you keep doing what you’re doing, you WON’T keep getting what you’re getting
- Environments change!
  - Adjust to changes
- New ideas keep the practice novel
- Spread the practice
  - To new settings
  - To new systems
Support for these projects:

- IES: NCSER (R324A120278, R324A180027)
- OSEP: TA Center on PBIS (H326S18001)
- Social Sciences and Humanities Council of Canada (SRG F09-05052)
- Hampton Endowment Fund (J07-0038)

Contact Information

- Kent McIntosh
  Special Education Program
  University of Oregon
  kentm@uoregon.edu
  @kentmc

Handouts: http://www.pbis.org